

**RE: Appendix F**

**Brattin, Bill** to: Benson.Bob

02/06/2013 12:32 PM

From: "Brattin, Bill" <brattin@srcinc.com>

To:

---

Did you, Linda, and Leonid get on the same page regarding the Chi squared calculation? Is this still a lingering issue?

It was never resolved. However, I think that use of ChiSq to test GOF for IH data does not make sense, since it is not a probability model

Leonid had a disagreement on the reason that the LOESS plots were bumpy (page F-15). Will this be a lingering issue if we leave as in the present version?

Not sure. I think it is obvious that the bumps comes from variable amounts of data, and I see little reason to change that view.

On page F-16 Leonid had wanted the nomenclature for a and b to be non-negative, rather than >0. Will this be a lingering issue if we leave as in the present version? The text under the formula uses the non-negative wording.

I will revise per his suggestion, although I do not see why it is an issue.

Page F-12, first bullet, the mention of the 1980 study can be confusing since there is no study in the reference list for 1980. I suggest rewording to "An archived UC document from the original site investigation with estimates..." OK?

I will revise as suggested.

My suggestion for page F-13 is to drop the text and table and insert after "vermiculite," This section will be updated after analysis of the South Carolina ore sample.

I will revise as suggested.

Are you comfortable sending a revised version to NCEA with figures and tables and see if we can get concurrence?

I think it is best to wait until we have the FBAS data for SC and decide what approach we want to use. The more times we send it, the more comments we get.

\*\*\*\*\*

Bill Brattin  
SRC, Inc.  
999 18th Street Suite 1150  
Denver CO 80202  
Phone: 303-357-3121

Fax: 303-292-4755  
e-mail: [brattin@srcinc.com](mailto:brattin@srcinc.com)

---

**From:** Benson.Bob@epamail.epa.gov [mailto:Benson.Bob@epamail.epa.gov]

**Sent:** Wednesday, February 06, 2013 12:06 PM

**To:** Brattin, Bill

**Subject:** Re: Appendix F

I think this reads much better and responds to most of Leonid's and Krista's comments on the statistical methods.

Did you, Linda, and Leonid get on the same page regarding the Chi squared calculation? Is this still a lingering issue?

Leonid had a disagreement on the reason that the LOESS plots were bumpy (page F-15). Will this be a lingering issue if we leave as in the present version?

On page F-16 Leonid had wanted the nomenclature for a and b to be non-negative, rather than >0. Will this be a lingering issue if we leave as in the present version? The text under the formula uses the non-negative wording.

Page F-12, first bullet, the mention of the 1980 study can be confusing since there is no study in the reference list for 1980. I suggest rewording to "An archived UC document from the original site investigation with estimates..." OK?

My suggestion for page F-13 is to drop the text and table and insert after "vermiculite." This section will be updated after analysis of the South Carolina ore sample.

Are you comfortable sending a revised version to NCEA with figures and tables and see if we can get concurrence?

▼ "Brattin, Bill" ---02/05/2013 11:14:32 AM---Here is most recent draft of Appendix F, revised by UC and me to respond to last set of NCEA comment

From: "Brattin, Bill" <[brattin@srcinc.com](mailto:brattin@srcinc.com)>  
To: Bob Benson/R8/USEPA/US@EPA, David Berry/R8/USEPA/US@EPA,  
Date: 02/05/2013 11:14 AM  
Subject: Appendix F

---

Here is most recent draft of Appendix F, revised by UC and me to respond to last set of NCEA comments as best we could.

\*\*\*\*\*

Bill Brattin  
SRC, Inc.  
999 18th Street Suite 1150  
Denver CO 80202  
Phone: 303-357-3121  
Fax: 303-292-4755  
e-mail: brattin@srcinc.com<<mailto:brattin@syrres.com>>

[attachment "winmail.dat" deleted by Bob Benson/R8/USEPA/US] [attachment "  
Appendix F REVISED v6.docx" deleted by Bob Benson/R8/USEPA/US] [attachment "  
Appendix F Figures.piz" deleted by Bob Benson/R8/USEPA/US] [attachment "Appendix  
F Tables.piz" deleted by Bob Benson/R8/USEPA/US]